Impact of the future coastal water temperature scenarios on the risk of potential growth of pathogenic *Vibrio* marine bacteria

Habiba Ferchichi, André St-Hilaire, Taha B.M.J. Ouarda, Benoît Levesque

PII: S0272-7714(20)30825-8

DOI: https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecss.2020.107094

Reference: YECSS 107094

- To appear in: Estuarine, Coastal and Shelf Science
- Received Date: 14 February 2020
- Revised Date: 9 September 2020
- Accepted Date: 2 November 2020

Please cite this article as: Ferchichi, H., St-Hilaire, André., Ouarda, T.B.M.J., Levesque, Benoî., Impact of the future coastal water temperature scenarios on the risk of potential growth of pathogenic *Vibrio* marine bacteria, *Estuarine, Coastal and Shelf Science* (2020), doi: https://doi.org/10.1016/ j.ecss.2020.107094.

This is a PDF file of an article that has undergone enhancements after acceptance, such as the addition of a cover page and metadata, and formatting for readability, but it is not yet the definitive version of record. This version will undergo additional copyediting, typesetting and review before it is published in its final form, but we are providing this version to give early visibility of the article. Please note that, during the production process, errors may be discovered which could affect the content, and all legal disclaimers that apply to the journal pertain.

© 2020 Published by Elsevier Ltd.



Authors' contributions

H.Ferchichi, A.St-Hilaire, T.B.M.J.Ouarda, and B.Lévesque participated in the design of the study. H.Ferchichi had completed the analysis under the supervision of A.St-Hilaire, T.B.M.J.Ouarda, and B.Lévesque.

H.Ferchichi had completed the bulk of the writing and prepared the Figures 1-3, with assistance from A.St-Hilaire, T.B.M.J.Ouarda, and B.Lévesque. All authors reviewed the manuscript.

...esque. A

| Impact of the future coastal water temperature |
|--|
| scenarios on the risk of potential growth of |
| pathogenic <i>Vibrio</i> marine Bacteria |
| |

4 Habiba Ferchichi^{1,*}, André St-Hilaire^{1, 2}, Taha B.M.J Ouarda³, Benoît Levesque^{4, 5}

5 Vibrio (V), a genus of marine bacteria, are common inhabitants of warm coastal waters and 6 estuaries. Vibrio includes V. parahaemolyticus and V. vulnificus species that can cause human 7 infections through the consumption of contaminated shellfish (as bivalve molluscs). The 8 growth of pathogenic Vibrio is related to ambient water temperature and seems to increase at 9 15 °C and over. The expansion of Vibrio infection outbreak is increasing worldwide due to the 10 increase of the sea surface temperature as a result of ocean warming. Canada's coast is not an 11 exception to this worldwide Vibrio spread. Faced with this issue, this study focuses on 12 modelling the future potential Vibrio growth risk along the coasts of the St. Lawrence Gulf and 13 Estuary, where the shellfish industry is well developed. This is done using the adequate 14 machine learning model with explanatory variables that include air temperature and wind 15 speed for predicting future water temperatures. Based on the predicted future water 16 temperature scenarios and a threshold of 15 °C to determine the conditions favorable to the 17 growth of Vibrio bacteria, we modelled the Vibrio growth risk indicator, i.e. the number of 18 days exceeding the minimum temperature for Vibrio pathogenic growth (15 °C), in the horizon 19 2040-2100. Simulations show that the number of days, where the minimum temperature 20 (15 °C) will be reached , will increase spatially and even seasonally and all the shellfish beds 21 would meet the temperature condition for Vibrio growth regardless of the climate scenario 22 (optimistic and pessimistic).

23 Key words: Coastal Water temperature, Vibrio bacteria, machine learning models, modelling,

24 prediction, climate change.

| 25 | Abbreviations: | ANN. A | Artificial | Neural | Networks: | Bagging. | Bootstrap | Aggregati | ng: |
|----|------------------|-------------------------------|-------------|--------|-----------|----------|-----------|-------------|-----|
| 20 | Tibble viacions. | <i>1</i> 11 11 1 <i>1 1</i> 1 | ii ciiiciui | neurui | neeworks, | Dugging, | Dootstrup | 1 SSI CSuth | |

26 CANOPA, CANadian Océan PArallélisé; CART, Classification and Regression Tree;

- 27 CDC, Centers for Disease Control and Prevention; GHG, Greenhouse Gas GSL; Gulf of
- 28 St. Lawrence; IDW, Inverse Distance Weighted; MA, Moving Average; MK, Mann-
- 29 Kendall; MLP, Multilayer Perceptron; MMK, Modified Mann-Kendall; MSE, Mean
- 30 Square Error; Nash, Nash-Sutcliffe coefficient; Ntry, The number of bootstrap input
- 31 variables at each split of a tree; OOB, Out-Of-Bag; PEI, Prince Edward Island; ppt,
- 32 parts per thousand; rBias, Relative mean bias; RCM, Regional Climate Model; RCP,
- 33 Representative Concentration Pathways; RF, Random Forests; RFE, Recursive
- 34 feature Elimination; RMSE, Root Mean Square Error; SST, Sea Surface Temperature;
- 35 Vibrio, V; Vibrio parahaemolyticus, Vp; Vibrio vulnificus, Vv.
- 36
- ¹ Institut National de la Recherche Scientifique, Centre Eau Terre Environnement, 490 de la
 Couronne, Québec, QC, G1K 9A9, Canada.
- 39 ² Canadian River Institute, University of New Brunswick, Fredericton, NB, Canada
- 40 ³ Canada Research Chair in Statistical Hydro-climatology, Institut National de la Recherche
- 41 Scientifique, Centre Eau Terre Environnement, 490 de la Couronne, Québec, QC, G1K 9A9, Canada.
- 42 ⁴ Direction de la santé environnementale et de la toxicologie, Institut national de santé publique du
- 43 Québec, 945 avenue Wolfe, Québec, Québec, G1V 5B3, Canada
- 44 ⁵ Département de médecine sociale et préventive, Faculté de médecine, Université Laval, Québec.
- 45 * Corresponding author: Habiba Ferchichi (ferchichihabiba1993gmail.com)

1. Introduction

| 47 | <i>Vibrio (V.) parahaem</i> olyticus and <i>Vibrio vulnificus</i> belong to the family of |
|----|---|
| 48 | Vibrionacea, a group of aquatic microorganisms that includes other human |
| 49 | pathogens such as V. cholera. They are natural inhabitants of warm coastal waters |
| 50 | (>15 °C) and estuaries with low salinity (<25 ppt) (Baker-Austin et al., 2010; Heng |
| 51 | et al., 2017; Kaspar and Tamplin, 1993; Motes et al., 1998; Vezzulli et al., 2013). |
| 52 | <i>V. parahaem</i> olyticus (<i>Vp</i>) is recognised as a leading cause of gastroenteritis |
| 53 | associated with seafood consumption worldwide (Martinez-Urtaza et al., 2010) and |
| 54 | it was the cause of significant outbreaks of infections in North America. For example, |
| 55 | the largest outbreak of <i>Vp</i> in Canadian history, associated with the consumption of |
| 56 | raw oysters, occurred in summer 2015 in British Colombia and resulted in the |
| 57 | highest reported Vp cases (82 cases) (Taylor et al., 2018) since the 1997 outbreak |
| 58 | (Fyfe et al., 1997). |
| 59 | <i>V. vulnificus</i> (<i>Vv</i>) infections are less frequent. However, <i>Vv</i> is a lethal opportunistic |
| 60 | human pathogen responsible for the majority of deaths related to seafood |
| 61 | consumption worldwide. For instance, in the USA, more than 95% of seafood- |
| 62 | related deaths are caused by this bacterium (Oliver, 2013). Consumption of raw or |
| 63 | undercooked bivalve shellfish (oysters, mussels, clams, etc.) contaminated with Vv |
| 64 | can lead to major infections such as septicemia, with subsequent highest mortality |
| 65 | (sometimes exceeding 50%) than any foodborne pathogen (Dechet et al., 2008; |
| 66 | Feldhusen, 2000; Oliver, 2005). In the USA, the CDC estimates an average of 100 |

foodborne infections associated to *Vv* annually, resulting in 50 fatalities per year
(Mead et al., 1999).

69 The growth of pathogenic Vibrio species causing human illness is directly related to 70 the exceedance of a threshold of water temperature (about 15 °C) (Baker-Austin et 71 al., 2013; Jacobs et al., 2015; Martinez-Urtaza et al., 2010; McLaughlin et al., 2005). 72 Because most of bivalves are filter feeders, Vibrio bacteria may concentrate in their 73 tissues. When the water temperature exceeds a certain threshold, shellfish are more 74 likely to be contaminated with Vibrio. These contaminated shellfish transmit, in 75 turn, the Vibrio bacteria to humans through consumption of raw or undercooked 76 shellfish (Baker-Austin et al., 2017; Davis et al., 2017; McLaughlin et al., 2005; Motes 77 and DePaola, 1996; Zimmerman et al., 2007).

78 Several reports and scientific researches show that the incidence of Vibrio infections 79 has increased significantly worldwide (Centers for Disease and Prevention, 2013; 80 Martinez-Urtaza et al., 2010; Newton et al., 2012). For instance, during the Canadian 81 Vp outbreak, the number of reported cases was 2.5 times the number of expected 82 cases and the outbreak unusually occurs earlier than expected (June-July) (Taylor et 83 al., 2018). This unusual outbreak emergence was associated with abnormally high 84 sea surface temperatures (SST>15°C) and the human Vp incidence decreased when 85 the SST decreased below 15°C (Taylor et al., 2018). Numerous studies on this Canadian Vp outbreak show that the sea surface temperature is the most significant 86 87 environmental predictor of the Vp proliferation in oysters and the Vp illness

| 88 | incidence is strongly associated with the increase of SST and the exceedance of the |
|-----|--|
| 89 | temperature threshold (Galanis et al., 2020; Konrad et al., 2017; Taylor et al., 2018). |
| 90 | In addition to the increase of spatial spread worldwide, sudden Vibrio outbreaks had |
| 91 | emerged in new temperate and even cold regions including Peru (Martinez-Urtaza |
| 92 | et al., 2008), Europe (Baker-Austin et al., 2010), Chile (Narjol et al., 2005) and |
| 93 | Alaska (McLaughlin et al., 2005). This unusual outbreak emergence of Vibrio |
| 94 | infections coincides with water temperatures anomalies (SST>15°C) (Baker-Austin |
| 95 | et al., 2017; Martinez-Urtaza et al., 2010). Many microbiologists agree that climate |
| 96 | change may explain this increase of Vibrio infections spread worldwide as well as |
| 97 | the likelihood of its geographical expansion in new areas (Baker-Austin et al., 2012; |
| 98 | Deeb et al., 2018; Martinez-Urtaza et al., 2010; McLaughlin, 2005; Vezzulli et al., |
| 99 | 2013; Vezzulli et al., 2016). They have even considered Vibrio pathogens as |
| 100 | microbial barometer of climate change (Baker-Austin et al., 2017). |
| 101 | The global average land-ocean temperature has risen by approximately 0.85 $^{ m oC}$ |
| 102 | since the late nineteenth century (IPCC, 2013). This increase in SST, caused by |
| 103 | atmospheric warming, heavily affects the coastal ecosystems (Baker-Austin et al., |
| 104 | 2017; Burge et al., 2014; Halpern et al., 2008), resulting in significant warming of |
| 105 | 70% of the world's coastline (Baker-Austin et al., 2017; Lima and Wethey, 2012). |
| 106 | In order to evaluate and manage the <i>Vibrio</i> infection risk, various models have been |
| 107 | developed. Among these models, some are related to the prediction of Vibrio |
| 108 | concentration, which is based either on only sea surface temperature (SST) (Chu et |
| 109 | al., 2011) or both SST and salinity (Jacobs et al., 2014; United States Food and Drug |
| | |

| 110 | Administration (FDA), 2005). Another category includes models developed to |
|-----|--|
| 111 | explain the relation of Vibrio infections exposure in response to SST |
| 112 | threshold exceedances (Semenza et al., 2017). Given the paucity of Vibrio |
| 113 | concentration and Vibrio infection data, the aim of this study is to evaluate the Vibrio |
| 114 | growth risk through its relation with SST threshold exceedances. |
| 115 | The harvesting of molluscs is an important part of the Canadian economy. It is well |
| 116 | developed in the provinces of Quebec, and Prince Edward Island (PEI). PEI is |
| 117 | Canada's top shellfish producer with about 49434 tons in 2018 between wild |
| 118 | shellfish and aquaculture, while Quebec produces about 1840 tons (Statistics |
| 119 | Canada, 2019). The shellfish beds are distributed over coastal zones of the Estuary |
| 120 | and Gulf of St. Lawrence (GSL), located in the eastern part of Canada, including |
| 121 | Rimouski, Gaspe, Baie des Chaleurs, the Quebec North Shore, Magdalen Islands and |
| 122 | PEI (Fig 1). |
| 123 | As the rest of worldwide marine ecosystems affected by ocean warming, the SST of |
| 124 | GSL has increased by 1 to 1.5 °C during 1982-2011 by calculating the annual |
| 125 | average of temperatures from May to November (Galbraith et al., 2012). The |
| 126 | predicted SST in Eastern Canada, through climate scenarios projections, indicate a |

127 possible rise by more than one degree Celsius during the next century (Galbraith et

al., 2012). Therefore, this increase of water temperature could lead to the

129 proliferation of *Vibrio* pathogens as well as shellfish contamination and human

130 infections.

In fact, a recent surveillance study on the diversity and dynamics of the *Vibrio*communities in Canada's coasts (British Columbia [Pacific Coast], Nova Scotia
[Atlantic Coast] and Gaspe) highlights the emergence of *V. cholerae* in temperate
Canadian estuaries and the detection of pathogenic strains of *V. parahaemolyticus* in
bivalve molluscs harvested in Canada (clams, mussels and oysters) with increasing
trend during the warmest months of 2006-2016 (Banerjee et al., 2018).

137 In order to protect the shellfish industry as well as human health, modelling the 138 future scenarios of SST in the Estuary and the GSL, with the aim of mapping future 139 potential risk areas, is primordial. Predicting SST in GSL has been generally realized 140 through deterministic model, based on physical and mathematical representation of 141 the climatic and ocean processes, such as the three-dimensional coastal ice-ocean 142 model called CANOPA (CANadian Océan PArallélisé) (Long et al., 2015; Saucier, 143 2003). Recently, we used machine learning models (Artificial Neuron Networks-144 ANN, and Random Forest-RF) in predicting daily SST in the GSL by entering a 145 combination of predictors (also known as features) explaining most of SST 146 variation: 3-day trailing Moving Average (MA) of daily mean air temperature (i.e. 147 average of daily mean air temperature of the present and two previous days), the 30 148 day-MA of daily mean wind speed, the 30 day-MA of maximum daily tidal range, 120 149 day-MA mean St. Lawrence freshwater runoff and 60 day-MA of North Atlantic 150 Oscillation (Ferchichi et al., 2019). The MAs are used as filters for smoothing 151 predictors' data and detecting a better association between the dependent (SST) 152 and independent variables. The results showed that Random Forests provided the 153 best SST prediction accuracy of historical SST in the GSL (Ferchichi et al., 2019). In

154 the same study, it has been demonstrated that both of the air temperature and wind 155 speed are the most relevant predictors by explaining more than 70% of SST 156 variation for most of the stations (Ferchichi et al., 2019). A recent study, focusing on 157 coastal water temperature prediction, shows the impact of daily maximum and the 158 average air temperature of previous 1 and 2 days on the daily water temperature 159 variation. Considering this lag time factor and entering these variables as predictors 160 improved significantly the daily coastal temperature prediction (Trinh et al., 2019). 161 In this paper, we present the future scenarios of *Vibrio* growth risk in the GSL by 162 modelling the future water temperatures under different climate scenarios 163 (optimistic and pessimistic). By entering the most relevant and readily available 164 predictors (air temperature and wind speed) to the machine learning models (ANN 165 and RF), we test their performance predictions and select the best inputs for each 166 model using the backward selection method (Recursive Feature Elimination-RFE). 167 After choosing the best model and entering the climate projections of the selected 168 predictors, we produce the future water temperature in both of optimist and 169 pessimist climatic scenarios. Finally, we map the future potential Vibrio growth risk 170 area in the Estuary and GSL by interpolating the calculated risk indicator, in relation 171 to the theoretical proliferation of pathogenic Vibrio, over our study area.

172 **2. Study Area**

The St. Lawrence River is the second largest river in North America (El-Sabh and
Murty, 1990), with an average flow of approximately 12100 m³/s (Galbraith et al.,

- 175 2017). Originating from the Great Lakes, it reaches a vast estuary, where the fresh
- 176 water of the river and salt water from the Atlantic Ocean mix. It flows over
- approximately 250 km to Pointe-des-Monts where it becomes the Gulf of St-
- 178 Lawrence, opened to the Atlantic Ocean through the straits of Cabot and Belle-Isle.
- 179 The GSL is one of the largest and most diverse marine ecosystems in the world
- 180 covering an area of 225000 km².
- 181 The study region, as shown in (Fig 1), covers the coastal areas of the Estuary
- 182 (downstream limit near Rimouski) and the Gulf of St-Lawrence (the Quebec North
- 183 Shore, Gaspe, Baie-des-Chaleurs, PEI and Magdalen Islands).



Figure 1. Geographic location of the thermographs and buoys in the Estuary and Gulf
 of Saint Lawrence
 187

| 188 | The most abundantly harvested shellfish in the GSL are oysters, mussels, clams and |
|-----|--|
| 189 | scallops (Statistics Canada, 2019). The major shellfish aquaculture techniques are |
| 190 | the intertidal, subtidal and suspended cultures. The shellfish produced using the |
| 191 | intertidal method are growing directly in the substrate. Since the clams and the |
| 192 | oysters may be farmed intertidally, they are more exposed to higher water |
| 193 | temperature at low tide, which increases the risk of Vibrio proliferation. In order to |
| 194 | provide assurance of bivalve molluscs' safety for human consumption, a Canadian |
| 195 | Shellfish Sanitation Programme (CSSP) was established (Sauvé, 2010). The aim of |
| 196 | this program is to monitor the shellfish growing areas, classify them with regard to |
| 197 | environmental conditions and water quality to determine the safety of shellfish |
| 198 | consumption, to monitor the marine biotoxins and to control the shellfish |
| 199 | harvesting and processing in these areas (Sauvé, 2010). |
| | |

3. Material and methods

3.1 Data collection

For modelling daily mean water temperature, we use the 3 day-MA mean air
temperature and 30 day-MA wind speed as they present the most relevant
explanatory variables of SST variation in the most of stations. The daily air
temperature and wind speed data are available online from the Government of
Canada through this site:
http://climate.weather.gc.ca/historical_data/search_historic_data_e.html.

| 209 | The daily sea surface temperatures of the buoys and costal thermographs were |
|-----|---|
| 210 | supplied by Fisheries and Oceans Canada and the Maurice-Lamontagne Institute. |
| 211 | The daily sea surface temperatures of coastal thermographs, located at shellfish |
| 212 | beds, were provided by MERINOV-Québec Centre for Innovation in Aquaculture and |
| 213 | Fisheries. |
| 214 | The predictor projections (daily air temperature and the 30-day MA wind speed) |
| 215 | come from eight climate simulations obtained from Ouranos-a climate-science |
| 216 | consortium based in Quebec (Martynov et al., 2013; Šeparović et al., 2013), and the |
| 217 | CORDEX program (Giorgi et al., 2009). These simulations are generated through |
| 218 | regional climate models driven by global climate model under one of the two |
| 219 | Representative Concentration Pathways (RCPs; RCP4.5 (Knutti and Sedláček, 2013) |
| 220 | or RCP8.5 (Meinshausen et al., 2011)). |

The scenarios used in this study were the average of the regional model outputs

222 mentioned in the Table 1.

| 223 | Table 1. List of the Regional Climate Models (RCMs) used in simulations. | | | | |
|-----|--|------------------|-------------------------|--|--|
| | Sources of RCMs | Modelling groups | Regional Climate | | |

| Sources of RCMS | Modelling groups | Model (RCM) |
|-----------------|--|-------------|
| Ouranos | - | CRCM5 |
| | DMI (Danish Meteorological Institute) | HIRHAM5 |
| CORDEX | UQUAM (L'Université du Québec à Montréal) | CRCM5 |

CCCma (Canadian Centre for Climate Modelling and Analysis) CanRCM4

224

225 3.2 Modelling water temperature

We model the target variable (the daily water temperature of each buoy and coastal 226 227 thermograph) by entering the selected predictors (3 day-MA air temperature and 228 30-day MA wind speed) into tested models (RF and ANN). The RFE was selected as 229 feature selection method in order to choose the best subset of the predictors. In this 230 case, only two combinations of the predictors were likely to be selected, either the 231 air temperature as the sole input variable, or both air temperature and wind speed. 232 80% of original data are used for training and the remaining data serve as test data 233 to evaluate the model predictive power. We use the k-fold cross validation (10-fold 234 cross validation) as model validation technique.

235 3.2.1 Artificial Neural Network Model

In this study, we use a Multilayer Perceptron (MLP), a feedforward Artificial Neural Network, trained by using the supervised learning based on the error gradient backpropagation algorithm. This class of model is composed of three layers: the input layer includes the predictors which are standardized by subtracting each variable by its means and dividing by its standard deviations, the output layer, composed of single node, produces the response variable (water temperature) and the hidden layer connects both of the input and output layers. At the state of hidden layer, the ANN attributes weights to the set of inputs (x_i) and applies an activation function (f_1) on the weighted sum of inputs. Then, a linear function (f_2) is applied on the output of the hidden layer to produce the desired output (0), given by:

$$0 = f_2 \left[\sum_{j=1}^n w_{jk} \left[f_1 \left(\sum_{j=1}^n w_{ij} x_i + b_j \right) \right] + b_0 \right]$$
(1)

Where w_{ij} is the weight between the input x_i and hidden neuron j, b_j is the bias associated to each hidden neuron j, w_{jk} is the weight between the hidden neuron jand the output neuron k, and b_0 is the bias associated to the output neuron . The activation function (f_1) used in this study is the sigmoid, given by:

$$f_1(x) = \frac{1}{1 + e^{-x}} \tag{2}$$

The used MLP is composed by one hidden layer holding only one neuron. A single hidden layer is sufficient to approximate any continuous function, but there is no general rule for selecting the appropriate number of hidden nodes in the hidden layer (Haykin, 1994; Piotrowski et al., 2015). The ANN architecture selection is done via the trial-error method. It tests the model performance by using a grid search of hidden neurons number (1 to 10 hidden nodes). Adding more than one neuron does not improve significantly the prediction accuracy.

257 **3.2.2** Random Forests Model

258 Random Forests (RF) is a recent machine learning algorithms (2000) developed by

- 259 Braiman (Breiman, 2001). The RF is a tree-based ensemble method that randomly
- selects a subset of predictors to build a binary tree based on bootstrap samples of
- the training data (Breiman, 2001). The overall prediction is the average of the
- 262 predictions from all the generated decision trees (Aggregation).

The RF generalization error is estimated by averaging the prediction error of each tree using the Out-Of-Bag (OOB) samples, i.e. samples that are not included in the bootstrap training sets (1/3 bootstrap samples of the training sets). This OOB error is computed with a Mean Square Error (MSE) as shown below:

$$MSE^{OOB} = \frac{1}{n} \times \sum_{i=1}^{n} [\hat{Y}(X_i) - Y_i]^2$$
(3)

267 Where n is the size of the OOB sample, $\hat{Y}(X_i)$ corresponds to the RF output given the 268 input sample X_i , and Y_i represents the actual output.

269 The parameters set are: the number of trees, the number of bootstrap input

270 variables at each split of a tree (Ntry) and the minimum node size of each tree. The

- 271 minimum node size of each tree, recommended by RF creators, and used in many
- studies is 5. The smaller the minimum node size is, the deeper that the tree is. The
- 273 Ntry, recommended by the RF developers, is the number of input variables divided
- by three (Breiman, 2001) (Ntry=1). The number of trees would be experimentally

set through plotting the OOB error plot in function of tree numbers (number oftrees=50).

277 **3.2.3** Feature Selection

278 The Recursive feature Elimination (RFE) presents a backward selection technique 279 used in selecting the best subset of input variables (features) that contribute the 280 most in model accuracy during the training process. The RFE consists in training the 281 model by entering all the features then removing the variables with the lowest 282 contribution in model accuracy, i.e., based on variable importance. Using the new 283 reduced feature subset, it retrains the model (Guyon et al., 2002). The best selected 284 subset is the one that optimizes the most of the chosen performance criteria. In this 285 study, we chose the RMSE as performance criterion for best subset features 286 selection.

We use the k-fold cross validation (k=10) in performance prediction assessment of
the possible feature subsets. In fact, the goodness of models fit, according to each
feature subset, is assessed by computing the 10-fold cross validated RMSE
(RMSE_{cv}), i.e. the average of the ten RMSE computed over the 10 validation sets:

291 The (RMSE_{CV}) is given by:

$$RMSE_{CV} = \frac{1}{k} \sum_{j=1}^{k} RMSE_j$$
(4)

292 Where the RMSE calculated for each fold j is given by:

$$RMSE_{j} = \sqrt{\sum_{i=1}^{N} \frac{(y_{i,p} - y_{i,obs})^{2}}{N}}$$
(5)

293 Where the k is the number of folds (10 in this example), j is one of the k folds, N is

294 the sample size of the fold j, $y_{i, p}$ are predicted data and $y_{i, obs}$ are the observed data.

295 **3.2.4 Performance evaluation of models**

In this paper, we compare the prediction accuracy of tested models (ANN and RF)
according to three performance criteria: the Root Mean Square Error (RMSE), Nash-

- 298 Sutcliffe coefficient (Nash) and Relative mean bias (rBias).
- 299 Root Mean Square Error (RMSE)

$$RMSE = \sqrt{\sum_{i=1}^{n} \frac{(y_{i,obs} - y_{i,p})^2}{n}}$$
(6)

• Nash-Sutcliffe coefficient (Nash)

$$Nash = 1 - \frac{\sum_{i=1}^{n} (y_{i,obs} - y_{i,p})^{2}}{\sum_{i=1}^{n} (y_{i,obs} - \overline{y}_{obs})^{2}}$$
(7)

• Relative mean bias (rBias)

$$rBias = \frac{100}{n} \times \sum_{i=1}^{n} \frac{y_{i,obs} - y_{i,p}}{y_{i,obs}}$$
 (8)

Where $y_{i,obs}$ is the observed data, $y_{i,p}$ is the predicted data, \overline{y}_{obs} corresponds to the means of observed data and *n* is the size of observed data. Generally, a computed value of Nash greater than 0.5 indicates a relative satisfactory model performance, with a value of 1 corresponding to an ideal model (N. Moriasi et al., 2007). Low values of RMSE and rBias indicate better performing models.

307 3.3 Trend Analysis

308 After selecting the best model for all the stations, we generate the projections of the 309 daily water temperature for the horizon 2040-2100. In order to cover the range of 310 plausible water temperature scenarios, we select two different climatic scenarios: a 311 relatively optimistic scenario (RCP4.5) and a pessimistic scenario (RCP8.5), known 312 as "Business as usual" (i.e. continuous rise in GHG emissions). These scenarios lead 313 to a warming of average air temperatures of 2.5 °C to 5 ° C around 2100. We 314 perform a trend analysis of the predicted water temperature for each station under 315 pessimistic scenario during the horizon 2040-2100 by using the Modified Mann 316 Kendall (MMK) test, which takes into account the serial correlation. Then, we 317 compute the trend slope of each station using the Theil-Sen's slope estimator.

- 318 3.3.1 Modified Mann Kendall test (MMK)
- 319 The non-parametric Mann-Kendall (MK) test is commonly used for detecting
- 320 monotonic trends in time series (Kendall, 1975; Mann, 1945). The null
- 321 hypothesis H_0 of this test is that there is no trend in the series.
- 322 The MK test statistic S is calculated as follows:

$$S = \sum_{i=1}^{n-1} \sum_{j=i+1}^{n} sgn(x_j - x_i)$$
(9)

Where x_i and x_j denote the values of observations for the respective periods i and j (j> i), *n* is the length of the times series and $sgn(x_i-x_j)$ presents the sign function given by:

$$sgn(x_{j} - x_{i}) \begin{cases} 1 \ if \ x_{j} - x_{i} > 1 \\ 0 \ if \ x_{j} - x_{i} = 0 \\ -1 \ if \ x_{j} - x_{i} < 1 \end{cases}$$
(10)

326

327 Mann (1945) and Kendall (1975) have noted that for large values of n ($n \ge 8$), the

328 distribution of the S statistic is approximately normal (Kendall, 1975; Mann, 1945),

329 with the mean *E* and variance *V* of the statistic *S*, are defined as follows:

$$E(S) = 0 \tag{11}$$

330

$$V(S) = \frac{n(n-1)(2n+5) - \sum_{i=1}^{m} t_i(i-1)(2i+5)}{18}$$
(12)

331 Where *m* represents the number of tied groups in the data set and the t_i represents 332 the number of values in the ith tied group.

333 The standardized statistic Z_S is calculated by:

$$Z_{S} = \begin{cases} \frac{S-1}{\sqrt{V(s)}} & \text{if } S > 0\\ 0 & \text{if } S = 0\\ \frac{S+1}{\sqrt{V(s)}} & \text{if } S < 0 \end{cases}$$

$$(13)$$

The sign of the statistic Z_S indicates the direction of the trend whether it is upward (positive Z_S) or downward (negative Z_S). The standardized statistic Z_S follows the standard normal distribution with a mean of 0 and variance of 1. The null hypothesis would be rejected, implying the presence of a significant trend, when Z_S is higher than a critical value $Z_{1-\alpha/2}$, where α represents the chosen significance level (5% in this study) and $Z_{1-\alpha/2}$ could be deduced from the standard normal cumulative distribution tables.

In order to account for the autocorrelation that may exist in the time series, Hamed
and Rao proposed to modify the variance of the MK test (Hamed and Rao, 1998).
The variance is corrected through multiplying by the factor n/n*, where n* presents
the effective sample size. Yue and Yang have demonstrated that incorporating the
effective sample size in variance correction limits effectively the effect of serial
correlation on the MK test (Yue and Wang, 2004).

$$\frac{n}{n^*} = 1 + \frac{2}{n(n-1)(n-2)} \sum_{i=1}^p (n-i)(n-i-1)(n-i-2) \rho_s(i)$$
(14)

- 347 Where *n* is the actual sample size, n^* is the effective sample size to account for
- 348 autocorrelations in the data, ρ_s presents the autocorrelation function of the ranks of
- 349 the observations for lag *i* and *p* is the maximum of time lags taking into account.
- 350 In this paper, the variance is corrected through considering complete
- autocorrelations (all lags) in the effective sample size computation, proposed by Yue
- and Wang (2004), and applied by using the mmky R package.
- 353 3.3.2 Theil-Sen's slope estimator
- Theil-Sen's slope estimator, proposed by Theil (1950) (Theil, 1950) and Sen (1968)
- 355 (Sen, 1968), allows to capture the direction and the strength of significant trend
- 356 slope. It has been considered as robust estimate of the magnitude of trend's slope
- 357 (Yue and Wang, 2004).
- 358 It is given by the following equation:

$$b = median\left(\frac{x_j - x_i}{j - i}\right) \forall i < j$$
(15)

359 **3.4 Mapping future potential risk growth Vibrio**

- 360 In order to evaluate the potential risk of *Vibrio* growth, we chose as thermal metric:
- the number of days above the minimum known temperature for *Vibrio* growth
- 362 (15 °C). This thermal metric, selected as *Vibrio* growth risk indicator, is computed
- 363 from the produced daily future water temperatures for both of optimistic and
- 364 pessimistic scenarios.

365 We calculate the monthly average of this risk indicator, during the study period 366 (June-October), averaged over twenty years during the study horizon 2040-2100. 367 Subsequently, we interpolate the risk indicator computed for the available stations 368 over the study area using the Inverse Distance Weighting (IDW) method, using 369 ARCGIS. As a result of a comparison between IDW and kriging, we select IDW 370 interpolation as it is the simplest method, given similar interpolation errors to 371 kriging. We produce maps for two selected future horizons 2040-2060 and 2080-372 2100 under both climate change scenarios (optimistic-RCP4.5 and pessimistic-373 RCP8.5) in order to compare the level of potential Vibrio expansion risk over the 374 study area.

We compute the root mean squared error (RMSE) of the interpolation using a leaveone-out procedure. The relative RMSE is calculated by dividing the RMSE of the IDW interpolation, produced for every month i of study period, by the areal average of the risk indicator for the same month. Sometimes the relative error is quite strong, which may be due to the large spatial variation of the selected variable. For cases that are too uncertain (relative error>50%), interpolation is useless.

381 **3.4.1** Inverse Weighted Distance (IWD) interpolation method

The IDW method, a deterministic spatial interpolation approach, allows to compute
an average of a selected variable in ungauged sites using values from nearby
weighted sites.

385 The weights, accorded to gauged locations, are proportional to the distance between

the gauged and ungauged sites and determined by the IDW power coefficient. The

larger the power coefficient is, the stronger the weights are attributed to the closest
locations. The estimated variable at ungauged location (z_j*) is defined by the
following equation:

$$z_j^* = \frac{\sum_{i=1}^n w_{ij} x_i}{\sum_{i=1}^n w_{ij}}$$

$$w_{ij} = \frac{1}{d_{ij}^p}$$
(16)

Where x_i is the variable value of a neighboring gauged site, w_{ij} is the weight assigned
to the gauged sites (i), d_{ij} is the distance between the gauged (i) and ungauged sites
(j), n is the number of gauged sites and p is the exponent of the distance. In this
study, the interpolation was performed using the ArcGIS software and a default
value of p = 2 was chosen.

396 4 Results

390

Where:

- 397 After applying the Recursive Feature Elimination (RFE) on the selected potential
- 398 predictors, air temperature and wind speed, we found that the ANN uses only the air
- 399 temperature as input for most of the stations while the RF uses both predictors.
- 400 Table 2 presents the results of performance criteria for ANN and RF in SST
- 401 prediction of the tested dataset.

403

Table 2. Performance criteria results of tested models (RF and ANN)

| Models | Stations | RMSE (°C) | Nash | rBiais(%) |
|-----------------------------|----------------------|-----------|-------|-----------|
| | Grande Rivière | 1.7 | 0.708 | -2.05 |
| | Borden | 1.991 | 0.585 | -1.529 |
| | Blanc Sablon | 2.437 | 0.331 | -13.774 |
| | Courant de Gaspé | 1.368 | 0.84 | -1.235 |
| | Havre St Pierre | 2.435 | 0.29 | -12.67 |
| | Ile Shag | 2.097 | 0.651 | -4.008 |
| ANN | Montlouis | 1.323 | 0.854 | -1.647 |
| (Artificial Neural Network) | Natashquan | 2.028 | 0.709 | -6.409 |
| | Rimouski | 1.139 | 0.827 | -0.779 |
| | Rivière aux Tonnerre | 2.015 | 0.627 | -7.809 |
| | Romaine | 1.345 | 0.816 | -2.929 |
| | Tabatière | 2.342 | 0.391 | -9.577 |
| | Sept-Îles | 1.957 | 0.702 | -3.175 |
| | Shediac Valley | 1.056 | 0.893 | -0.568 |
| | Mean | 1.802 | 0.659 | -4.868 |
| | Grande Rivière | 1.654 | 0.708 | -1.877 |
| | Borden | 1.837 | 0.585 | -0.66 |
| | Blanc Sablon | 2.29 | 0.331 | -10.614 |
| | Courant de Gaspé | 1.37 | 0.84 | -1.018 |
| | Havre St Pierre | 2.519 | 0.29 | -10.844 |
| | Ile Shag | 1.958 | 0.685 | -3.478 |
| RF | Montlouis | 1.418 | 0.687 | -1.407 |
| (Random Forests) | Natashquan | 2.082 | 0.693 | -4.756 |
| | Rimouski | 1.157 | 0.827 | -0.794 |
| | Rivière aux Tonnerre | 2.08 | 0.627 | -6.377 |
| | Romaine | 1.404 | 0.816 | -2.496 |
| | Tabatière | 2.323 | 0.391 | -7.193 |
| | Sept-Îles | 1.982 | 0.702 | -3.676 |
| | Shediac Valley | 1.02 | 0.893 | -0.43 |
| | Mean | 1.792 | 0.648 | -3.973 |

| 405 | By using the paired t-test (DF=13, t-value=0.436) on RMSE values at all of our sites |
|-----|---|
| 406 | for both models, we note that there is no significant difference between the |
| 407 | performances of models in terms of RMSE (p-value=0.67) at a significance level of |
| 408 | 5%. The average RMSE performance for all the stations is approximately 1.8 °C for |
| 409 | both of RF and ANN. Both models present good performing results in terms of Nash- |
| 410 | Sutcliff criterion, i.e. higher than 0.5, and low relative mean bias (<5%). Given that |
| 411 | there is no significant difference between RF and ANN, we choose the ANN as it is |
| 412 | the most parsimonious model for modelling future water temperatures. Then, we |
| 413 | proceed to generate future daily mean water temperature for each station for the |
| 414 | horizon 2040-2100 for a pessimistic climate scenario, RCP8.5, and a more optimistic |
| 415 | one (RCP4.5), by using the projections of air temperature. |
| 416 | We proceed with a trend analysis of the predicted water temperature for each |
| 417 | station under pessimistic scenario during the horizon 2040-2100 by using the |
| 418 | Modified Mann Kendall (MMK) test, which takes into account the serial correlation. |
| 419 | Significant positive trends (p-value<1%) in future daily mean SST, for the period |
| 420 | from June to October in the horizon 2040-2100, were revealed in all the tested |
| 421 | stations at a significance level of 5%. Table 3 presents the results of Theil Sen's slope |
| 422 | computed for each station after applying the MMK test. By averaging the trend |
| 423 | slopes of all the stations over the horizon (2040-2100), we found that the water |
| 424 | temperatures are likely to increase by 0.4 °C per decade, for a total of 2.5 °C up to |
| 425 | 2100. |

| Stations | Theil- Sen's slope | ^a Slope-10 years | ^b Slope- 60years |
|-------------------------|--------------------------|--------------------------------|--------------------------------|
| Natashquan | 4.59E-04 | 0.711 | 4.266 |
| Baie Cascapedia | 1.69E-04 | 0.262 | 1.57 |
| Baie Trascapedia | 1.73E-04 | 0.269 | 1.613 |
| Sept-Îles | 2.42E-04 | 0.376 | 2.255 |
| Baie Plaisance | 1.34E-04 | 0.208 | 1.245 |
| Lagune Havre | 3.31E-04 | 0.513 | 3.079 |
| Bassin Havre | 3.71E-04 | 0.575 | 3.447 |
| Lagune Grande | 3.16E-04 | 0.489 | 2.935 |
| Belles Amours | 2.81E-04 | 0.436 | 2.618 |
| Blanc Sablon | 2.64E-04 | 0.41 | 2.458 |
| Borden | 1.49E-04 | 0.232 | 1.39 |
| Grande Rivière | 1.66E-04 | 0.257 | 1.54 |
| Iles Shag | 1.50E-04 | 0.233 | 1.4 |
| Havre St Pierre | 1.75E-04 | 0.271 | 1.624 |
| Rivière aux Tonnerre | 4.10E-04 | 0.635 | 3.813 |
| Romaine | 4.49E-04 | 0.696 | 4.176 |
| Tarbatière | 3.30E-04 | 0.512 | 3.072 |
| Rimouski | 3.77E-04 | 0.584 | 3.506 |
| Courant Gaspé | 2.57E-04 | 0.399 | 2.391 |
| Gyre Anticosti | 2.02E-04 | 0.312 | 1.875 |

426 Table 3. Theil-Sen's slope for projected daily mean water temperature times series 427 during the horizon (2040-2100)

| Mean | 2.67E-04 | 0.414 | 2.482 |
|----------------|----------|-------|-------|
| Shediac Valley | 2.03E-04 | 0.315 | 1.889 |
| Montlouis | 2.63E-04 | 0.407 | 2.443 |

^a Slope-10 years: the average of Theil-Sen's slope for 10 years for the time period between June and October
^b Slope-60years: the average of Theil-Sen's slope for 60 years for the time period between June and October

432

433 After generating the future daily means of SST, we calculate the number of days

434 exceeding the threshold of 15 °C, the minimum temperature for *Vibrio* growth, as a

435 risk indicator. Then, we interpolate the values of this risk indicator, averaged for

436 each month over 20 years. We present the results of August and September as

437 examples of spatial interpolation of the risk indicator over the study area in Figures

438 2 and 3 respectively.



Figure 2. Inverse Distance Weighting (IDW) interpolation of risk indicators (number of days exceeding the threshold (15 °C)) over the Estuary and Gulf of St. Lawrence under pessimistic and optimistic climatic scenario for the horizons (2040-2060) and (2080-2100) in August. (a) IDW interpolation of the risk indicator in August during the horizon (2040-2060) under optimistic scenario (RCP4.5). (b) IDW interpolation of the risk indicator in August during the horizon (2080-2100) under optimistic scenario (RCP4.5). (c) IDW interpolation of the risk indicator in August during the horizon (2080-2100) under optimistic scenario (RCP8.5). (c) IDW interpolation of the risk indicator in August during the horizon (2080-2100) under optimistic scenario (RCP8.5). (c) IDW interpolation of the risk indicator in August during the horizon (2080-2100) under optimistic scenario (RCP8.5). (c) IDW interpolation of the risk indicator in August during the horizon (2080-2100) under optimistic scenario (RCP8.5). (c) IDW interpolation of the risk indicator in August during the horizon (2080-2100) under optimistic scenario (RCP8.5). (c) IDW interpolation of the risk indicator in August during the horizon (2080-2100) under optimistic scenario (RCP8.5).



Figure 3. Inverse Distance Weighting (IDW) interpolation of risk indicators (number of days exceeding the threshold (15 °C)) over the Estuary and Gulf of 439 St. Lawrence under pessimistic and optimistic climatic scenario for the horizons (2040-2060) and (2080-2100) in September. (a) IDW interpolation of the risk indicator in September during the horizon (2040-2060) under optimistic scenario (RCP4.5). (b) IDW interpolation of the risk indicator in September during the horizon (2040-2060) under optimistic scenario (RCP4.5). (c) IDW interpolation of the risk indicator in September during the horizon (2080-2100) under pessimistic scenario (RCP8.5). (c) IDW interpolation of the risk indicator in September during the horizon (2080-2100) under pessimistic scenario (RCP8.5). (c) IDW interpolation of the risk indicator in September during the horizon (2080-2100) under optimistic scenario (RCP4.5). (d) IDW interpolation of the risk indicator in September during the horizon (2080-2100) under pessimistic scenario (RCP8.5).

440 Figure 2(a) shows that, during the horizon 2040-2060, under an optimistic scenario 441 (RCP4.5), the waters in the shellfish beds of Magdalen Islands, PEI, the Gaspe 442 Peninsula and Baie des Chaleurs are likely to be at high risk of infection as the risk 443 indicator (number of days above the 15 °C) exceeds 25 days. The risk indicator of 444 some stations in the Quebec North Shore coast along the GSL varies between 20 and 445 25 days, so the shellfish beds in this area might also be under high risk of *Vibrio* 446 growth. For the same horizon, but under a pessimistic scenario as shown in Figure 447 2(b), most shellfish beds would probably be at high risk of *Vibrio* growth since the 448 calculated risk indicator exceeds 25 days for approximately 67% of coastal areas. 449 By comparing the interpolation maps of August (Fig 2(c) and Fig 2(d)) during the 450 horizon 2080-2100 for both scenarios, we note that the risk indicator, exceeding 25 451 days, covers between 64% (scenario RCP4.5) and 95% (scenario RCP8.5) of the total 452 coastal area. Therefore, by 2100, most of the stations located in shellfish beds, 453 where harvesting occurs, are likely to be at high risk of *Vibrio* growth whatever the 454 considered scenario.

During September (Fig 3), the risk indicator at the shellfish beds of the Magdalen
Islands and PEI exceeds 20 days for both climate scenarios and horizons. So, they
might be at a higher risk of *Vibrio* growth. During the horizon (2080-2100) under a
pessimistic scenario (Fig 3(d)), we note that in addition to the Magdalen Islands and
PEI, the shellfish beds of Gaspe Peninsula and Baie des Chaleurs would probably be
at high risk of *Vibrio* growth as the number of days above the 15 °C threshold
exceeds 20 days.

| 462 | Table 4 presents the results of the risk indicator calculated for the month of October |
|-----|--|
| 463 | for some stations under a pessimistic scenario during the horizon 2080-2100. It was |
| 464 | not possible to perform a spatial interpolation because too few stations had non- |
| 465 | zero values. Table 4 shows that the risk of Vibrio growth may also occur during |
| 466 | October on the coasts of PEI and Magdalen Islands. Therefore, the risk of Vibrio |
| 467 | growth would probably expand both spatially and temporally (i.e. into the fall for |
| 468 | some regions). |

<sup>Table 4. The number of days exceeding the minimum temperature threshold (15 °C)
for the growth of pathogenic Vibrio during October in the horizon (2080-2100) under
pessimistic scenario (RCP-8.5)</sup>

| Localisation | stations | October | |
|--------------|----------------|---------|--|
| PEI | Borden | 19 | |
| | Baie Plaisance | 6 | |
| Magdalen | Bassin Havre | 20 | |
| Islands | Lagune Havre | 16 | |
| | Lagune Grande | 14 | |
| | Ile Shag | 4 | |

472

473 The risk assessment was not just limited to one risk indicator. We also compute the 474 number of days exceeding a threshold of 20 °C. In fact, the increasing water 475 temperature trend under the pessimistic scenario results in exceedance of the 476 higher temperatures thresholds (20 °C) associated with higher abundance of Vibrio, 477 in contrast with the optimistic scenario where the water temperature does not 478 exceed the 20°C threshold. Table 5 presents the stations that would be at high risk 479 of pathogenic *Vibrio* growth. For the rest of the stations, the number of days 480 exceeding 20 °C is zero so they have not been included in the table. Table 5 shows 481 that during 2080-2100 under a pessimistic scenario, the threshold of 20 °C would be

| 482 | exceeded along the coast | of the Magdalen Islands | , where the blue mussel | ls, clams |
|-----|--------------------------|-------------------------|-------------------------|-----------|
|-----|--------------------------|-------------------------|-------------------------|-----------|

- 483 and scallops are harvested, the threshold of 20 °C would be exceeded for about 31
- 484 days in August against an average of 18 days in September".
- 485 The shellfish beds of mussels and scallops in the Gaspe Peninsula could be at the
- 486 same degree of risk with about 30 days in August while the shellfish beds of PEI
- 487 (mussels, oysters and clams) and North Shore would be under a lower risk with an
- 488 average of 16 days.
- 489 Table 5. The number of days exceeding the threshold (20 °C) in the horizon (2080490 2100) under pessimistic scenario (RCP 8.5)

| LocalisationstationsAugustSeptemberNorth ShoreNatashquan170Magdalen IslandsBassin Havre3122Lagune Havre3116Lagune Grande3116GaspéHavre Gaspé304PEIBorden160 | | | | |
|---|------------------|---------------|--------|-----------|
| North ShoreNatashquan170Bassin Havre3122Magdalen IslandsLagune Havre3116Lagune Grande3116GaspéHavre Gaspé304PEIBorden160 | Localisation | stations | August | September |
| Bassin Havre3122Magdalen IslandsLagune Havre3116Lagune Grande3116GaspéHavre Gaspé304PEIBorden160 | North Shore | Natashquan | 17 | 0 |
| Magdalen IslandsLagune Havre3116Lagune Grande3116GaspéHavre Gaspé304PEIBorden160 | | Bassin Havre | 31 | 22 |
| Lagune Grande3116GaspéHavre Gaspé304PEIBorden160 | Magdalen Islands | Lagune Havre | 31 | 16 |
| GaspéHavre Gaspé304PEIBorden160 | | Lagune Grande | 31 | 16 |
| PEI Borden 16 0 | Gaspé | Havre Gaspé | 30 | 10 |
| 16 0 | PEI | Borden | 30 | 4 |
| | | Doruch | 16 | 0 |

499

500 **5 Discussion**

501 By using one or both of the most relevant predictors, air temperature and wind

502 speed, the results show that the SST prediction performance of ANN and RF were

- 503 similar. However, RF requires more predictors than ANN to achieve similar
- 504 prediction performance. Thus, we select the ANN for SST prediction and used the

mean of climate models projections of air temperature, as input for ANN model,
without exploring the variability between the projections.

507 Modelling future water temperature through ANN constitutes a useful tool to 508 predict the plausible future water temperatures in the coastline of the Estuary and 509 GSL where shellfish beds occur. The trend analysis results for daily mean water 510 temperature, using the MMK test, indicates that our study area exhibits a significant 511 increasing trend by 2.5 °C up to 2100 under a pessimistic scenario. This positive 512 trend in water temperature implies a rise in risk indicator of Vibrio growth. This 513 result is demonstrated in the interpolation maps between the horizons 2040-2060 514 and 2080-2100. In fact, by comparing the interpolation maps in August for both of 515 the horizons under the pessimistic scenario (RCP8.5), we note an expansion of 516 Vibrio growth risk from 64% to 95% of the total coastal area of the Estuary and the 517 Gulf of Saint Lawrence. The risk indicator distribution during July was similar to 518 August so the shellfish beds would be exposed to a similar risk as in August under 519 both scenarios. Whereas, in June the risk of Vibrio growth would be less severe than 520 August and July except over the horizon (2080-2100) under pessimistic scenario, 521 where all the shellfish beds on the coasts of North Shore, Gaspe Peninsula, Baie des 522 Chaleurs, Magdalen Islands and PEI would be under high risk of Vibrio growth. Their 523 risk indicator could exceed an average of 20 days.

The results of risk indicator interpolation in August, suggest that *Vibrio* growth risk
may increase under both of pessimistic or optimistic scenario so all the shellfish
beds practically (on the coasts of North Shore, Gaspe Peninsula, Baie des Chaleurs,

527 Magdalen Islands and PEI) would be at risk of *Vibrio* growth regardless the scenario.

528 In addition to this spatial spread, the *Vibrio* growth risk would extend seasonally by

529 occurring out of the summer time during September and even October, especially on

530 the coasts of Magdalen Islands and PEI.

531 The lowest temperature threshold for the *Vibrio* growth, based on the literature, is

532 15 °C. Computing the number of days exceeding a higher temperature threshold

533 (20 °C) allowed to locate the shellfish beds that would be at higher risk of *Vibrio*

534 growth, like the Magdalen Islands and PEI.

535 This study focused on surface temperatures (average depth of 1.5 m). Wild molluscs

536 can be found or harvested at this depth, e.g. on the foreshore or near the islands.

537 However, in some cases, molluscs harvesting occurs in deeper water (e.g. oysters).

538 The risk maps produced may be biased, i.e. the risk of *Vibrio* growth may be

overestimated, as there may be significant thermal stratification in some coastal

540 sites. Molluscs that are found under the thermocline may not be as much as risks as

541 those in shallow, well mixed areas.

542 In this study, we focused on water temperature as the main factor affecting *Vibrio*

543 growth. However, it should be noted that many studies confirm the importance of

salinity in *Vibrio* growth. So, future work on *Vibrio* risk management should

545 concentrate of the combined effects of water temperature and salinity on the

546 proliferation of pathogenic *Vibrio* and use the projections of both variables to better

547 locate the potential risk areas followed by sampling of water and shellfish to

548 confirm the presence of *Vibrio*.

549 Acknowledgements

- 550 The authors would like to thank Ouranos for funding this research.
- 551 We also thank Ouranos for generating and supplying the Canadian Regional Climate
- 552 Model (CRCM5) data.
- 553 The authors would like to thank Pr. Yves Gratton for helping to find data sources.
- 554 The authors would like to thank MERINOV for providing us with the data in the

555 shellfish areas.

- 556 We would also like to thank Estelle Pedneault and Céline Campagna for their
- 557 contribution and help.
- 558 The authors would like to thank Gabriel Rondeau-Genesse for providing us with the
- 559 required variable projections.
- 560 The Canadian Regional Climate Model (CRCM5) was developed by the ESCER Centre
- at UQAM (Université du Québec à Montréal) with the collaboration of Environment
- and Climate Change Canada.
- 563 CRCM5 computations were made on the supercomputer guillimin from McGill
- 564 University, managed by Calcul Québec and Compute Canada. The operation of this
- 565 supercomputer is funded by the Canada Foundation For Innovation (CFI), the
- 566 ministère de l'Économie, de la science et de l'innovation du Québec (MESI) and the
- 567 Fonds de recherché du Québec- Nature et technologies (FRQ-NT).

- 568 We also thank the Natural Sciences and Engineering Research Council of Canada
- 569 (NSERC) and The Canadian Foundation for Climate and Atmospheric
- 570 Sciences (CFCAS) for the funding of the development of the CRCM5.
- 571 We acknowledge the World Climate Research Programme's Working Group on
- 572 Regional Climate, and the Working Group on Coupled Modelling, former
- 573 coordinating body of CORDEX and responsible panel for CMIP5. We also thank the
- 574 climate modelling groups (listed in Table 1 on this paper) for producing and making
- available their model output. We also acknowledge the U.S. Department of Defense
- 576 ESTCP for its support of the NA-CORDEX data archive.
- 577 The authors are grateful to the Editor, Dr. Steve Mitchell, and to anonymous
- 578 reviewers for their comments which helped improve the quality of the manuscript.
- 579

580 **References**

581

Baker-Austin, C., Stockley, L., Rangdale, R., Martinez-Urtaza, J., 2010. Environmental
occurrence and clinical impact of Vibrio vulnificus and Vibrio parahaemolyticus: a
European perspective. Environmental microbiology reports 2, 7-18.

- Baker-Austin, C., Trinanes, J., Gonzalez-Escalona, N., Martinez-Urtaza, J., 2017. NonCholera Vibrios: The Microbial Barometer of Climate Change. Trends in
 microbiology 25, 76-84.
- Baker-Austin, C., Trinanes, J.A., Taylor, N.G., Hartnell, R., Siitonen, A., MartinezUrtaza, J., 2013. Emerging Vibrio risk at high latitudes in response to ocean
 warming. Nature Climate Change 3, 73.
- Baker-Austin, C., Trinanes, J.A., Taylor, N.G.H., Hartnell, R., Siitonen, A., MartinezUrtaza, J., 2012. Emerging Vibrio risk at high latitudes in response to ocean
 warming. Nature Climate Change 3, 73-77.

Banerjee, S.K., Rutley, R., Bussey, J., 2018. Diversity and dynamics of the Canadian
coastal Vibrio community: an emerging trend detected in the temperate regions.
Journal of bacteriology 200, e00787-00717.

597 Breiman, L., 2001. Random forests. Machine learning 45, 5-32.

Burge, C.A., Mark Eakin, C., Friedman, C.S., Froelich, B., Hershberger, P.K., Hofmann,
E.E., Petes, L.E., Prager, K.C., Weil, E., Willis, B.L., Ford, S.E., Harvell, C.D., 2014.
Climate change influences on marine infectious diseases: implications for
management and society. Annual review of marine science 6, 249-277.

602 Centers for Disease, C., Prevention, 2013. Incidence and trends of infection with 603 pathogens transmitted commonly through food - foodborne diseases active 604 surveillance network, 10 U.S. sites, 1996-2012. MMWR. Morbidity and mortality 605 weekly report 62, 283-287.

606 Chu, C., Do, Y., Kim, Y., Saito, Y., Lee, S.-D., Park, H., Lee, J.-K., 2011. Mathematical
607 modeling of Vibrio vulnificus infection in Korea and the influence of global warming.
608 Osong public health and research perspectives 2, 51-58.

Davis, B.J.K., Jacobs, J.M., Davis, M.F., Schwab, K.J., DePaola, A., Curriero, F.C., 2017.
Environmental determinants of Vibrio parahaemolyticus in the Chesapeake Bay.
Applied and environmental microbiology.

Dechet, A.M., Yu, P.A., Koram, N., Painter, J., 2008. Nonfoodborne Vibrio infections:
an important cause of morbidity and mortality in the United States, 1997-2006.
Clinical infectious diseases : an official publication of the Infectious Diseases Society
of America 46, 970-976.

Deeb, R., Tufford, D., Scott, G.I., Moore, J.G., Dow, K., 2018. Impact of Climate Change
on Vibrio vulnificus Abundance and Exposure Risk. Estuaries and Coasts 41, 22892303.

El-Sabh, M.I., Murty, T.S., 1990. Mathematical modelling of tides in the St. Lawrence
Estuary, Oceanography of a Large-Scale Estuarine System. Springer, pp. 10-50.

Feldhusen, F., 2000. The role of seafood in bacterialfoodborne diseases. Microbesand infection 2, 1651-1660.

Ferchichi, H., St-Hilaire, A., Ouarda, T.B.M.J., Lévesque, B., 2019. Modélisation des
scénarios futurs de température de l'eau en milieu côtier et implications sur les
infections potentielles par Vibrio parahaemolyticus et Vibrio vulnificus : application
aux bancs coquillers de l'estuaire et du golfe du st-laurent (Master's thesis), Centre
Eau Terre Environnement. Institut national de la recherche scientifique, Quebec,
Canada, p. 132.

Fyfe, M., Yeung, S.T., Daly, P., Schallie, K., Kelly, M.T., Buchanan, S., 1997. Outbreak of
Vibrio parahaemolyticus related to raw oysters in British Columbia. Can Commun
Dis Rep 23, 145-148.

Galanis, E., Otterstatter, M., Taylor, M., 2020. Measuring the impact of sea surface
temperature on the human incidence of Vibrio sp. infection in British Columbia,
Canada, 1992–2017. Environmental Health 19, 58.

Galbraith, P.S., Chassé, J., Gilbert, D., Larouche, P., Brickman, D., Pettigrew, B., Devine,
L., Gosselin, A., Pettipas, R., Lafleur, C., 2017. Physical oceanographic conditions in
the Gulf of St. Lawrence in 2016. Canadian Science Advisory Secretariat.

Galbraith, P.S., Larouche, P., Chassé, J., Petrie, B., 2012. Sea-surface temperature in
relation to air temperature in the Gulf of St. Lawrence: Interdecadal variability and
long term trends. Deep Sea Research Part II: Topical Studies in Oceanography 77-80,
10-20.

Giorgi, F., Jones, C., Asrar, G.R., 2009. Addressing climate information needs at the
regional level: the CORDEX framework. World Meteorological Organization (WMO)
Bulletin 58, 175.

Guyon, I., Weston, J., Barnhill, S., Vapnik, V., 2002. Gene Selection for Cancer
Classification using Support Vector Machines. Machine Learning 46, 389-422.

Halpern, B.S., Walbridge, S., Selkoe, K.A., Kappel, C.V., Micheli, F., D'Agrosa, C., Bruno,
J.F., Casey, K.S., Ebert, C., Fox, H.E., Fujita, R., Heinemann, D., Lenihan, H.S., Madin,
E.M., Perry, M.T., Selig, E.R., Spalding, M., Steneck, R., Watson, R., 2008. A global map
of human impact on marine ecosystems. Science 319, 948-952.

Hamed, K.H., Rao, A.R., 1998. A modified Mann-Kendall trend test for autocorrelated
data. Journal of hydrology 204, 182-196.

Haykin, S., 1994. Neural networks: a comprehensive foundation. Prentice Hall PTR.

Heng, S.-P., Letchumanan, V., Deng, C.-Y., Ab Mutalib, N.-S., Khan, T.M., Chuah, L.-H.,
Chan, K.-G., Goh, B.-H., Pusparajah, P., Lee, L.-H., 2017. Vibrio vulnificus: An
Environmental and Clinical Burden. Frontiers in microbiology 8, 997-997.

IPCC, 2013. Climate Change 2013: The Physical Science Basis. Contribution of
Working Group I to the Fifth Assessment Report of the Intergovernmental Panel on
Climate Change. Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, United Kingdom and New
York, NY, USA.

Jacobs, J., Moore, S.K., Kunkel, K.E., Sun, L., 2015. A framework for examining
climate-driven changes to the seasonality and geographical range of coastal
pathogens and harmful algae. Climate Risk Management 8, 16-27.

Jacobs, J.M., Rhodes, M., Brown, C.W., Hood, R.R., Leight, A., Long, W., Wood, R., 2014.
Modeling and forecasting the distribution of Vibrio vulnificus in Chesapeake Bay.
Journal of applied microbiology 117, 1312-1327.

Kaspar, C.W., Tamplin, M.L., 1993. Effects of temperature and salinity on the survival
of Vibrio vulnificus in seawater and shellfish. Applied and environmental
microbiology 59, 2425-2429.

- 670 Kendall, M., 1975. Rank Correlation Methods. Griffin, London.
- Knutti, R., Sedláček, J., 2013. Robustness and uncertainties in the new CMIP5 climate
 model projections. Nature Climate Change 3, 369.
- Konrad, S., Paduraru, P., Romero-Barrios, P., Henderson, S.B., Galanis, E., 2017.
 Remote sensing measurements of sea surface temperature as an indicator of Vibrio
 parahaemolyticus in oyster meat and human illnesses. Environmental Health 16, 92.
- Lima, F.P., Wethey, D.S., 2012. Three decades of high-resolution coastal sea surface
 temperatures reveal more than warming. Nature Communications 3, 704.
- Long, Z., Perrie, W., Chassé, J., Brickman, D., Guo, L., Drozdowski, A., Hu, H., 2015.
 Impacts of Climate Change in the Gulf of St. Lawrence. Atmosphere-Ocean 54, 337351.
- Mann, H.B., 1945. Nonparametric tests against trend. Econometrica: Journal of theEconometric Society, 245-259.
- Martinez-Urtaza, J., Bowers, J.C., Trinanes, J., DePaola, A., 2010. Climate anomalies
 and the increasing risk of Vibrio parahaemolyticus and Vibrio vulnificus illnesses.
 Food Research International 43, 1780-1790.
- Martinez-Urtaza, J., Huapaya, B., Gavilan, R.G., Blanco-Abad, V., Ansede-Bermejo, J.,
 Cadarso-Suarez, C., Figueiras, A., Trinanes, J., 2008. Emergence of asiatic vibrio
 diseases in south america in phase with El Niño. Epidemiology 19, 829-837.
- Martynov, A., Laprise, R., Sushama, L., Winger, K., Šeparović, L., Dugas, B., 2013.
 Reanalysis-driven climate simulation over CORDEX North America domain using the
 Canadian Regional Climate Model, version 5: model performance evaluation. Climate
 Dynamics 41, 2973-3005.
- 693 McLaughlin, 2005. climate anomalies and the increasing risk of Vibrio.
- McLaughlin, J.B., DePaola, A., Bopp, C.A., Martinek, K.A., Napolilli, N.P., Allison, C.G.,
 Murray, S.L., Thompson, E.C., Bird, M.M., Middaugh, J.P., 2005. Outbreak of Vibrio
 parahaemolyticus gastroenteritis associated with Alaskan oysters. New England
 Journal of Medicine 353, 1463-1470.

Mead, P.S., Slutsker, L., Dietz, V., McCaig, L.F., Bresee, J.S., Shapiro, C., Griffin, P.M.,
Tauxe, R.V., 1999. Food-related illness and death in the United States. Emerging
infectious diseases 5, 607.

Meinshausen, M., Smith, S.J., Calvin, K., Daniel, J.S., Kainuma, M.L.T., Lamarque, J.-F.,
Matsumoto, K., Montzka, S.A., Raper, S.C.B., Riahi, K., Thomson, A., Velders, G.J.M., van
Vuuren, D.P.P., 2011. The RCP greenhouse gas concentrations and their extensions
from 1765 to 2300. Climatic Change 109, 213.

Motes, M.L., DePaola, A., 1996. Offshore suspension relaying to reduce levels of
Vibrio vulnificus in oysters (Crassostrea virginica). Applied and environmental
microbiology 62, 3875-3877.

Motes, M.L., DePaola, A., Cook, D.W., Veazey, J.E., Hunsucker, J.C., Garthright, W.E.,
Blodgett, R.J., Chirtel, S.J., 1998. Influence of Water Temperature and Salinity on
Vibrio vulnificus in Northern Gulf and Atlantic Coast Oysters (Crassostrea virginica).
Applied and environmental microbiology 64, 1459-1465.

- 712 N. Moriasi, D., G. Arnold, J., W. Van Liew, M., L. Bingner, R., D. Harmel, R., L. Veith, T.,
- 713 2007. Model Evaluation Guidelines for Systematic Quantification of Accuracy in
- 714 Watershed Simulations. Transactions of the ASABE 50, 885-900.

Narjol, G.-E., Viviana, C., Claudia, A., María, L.R., Juan, A.V., Felipe, C., Jaime, R.,
Romilio, T.E., 2005. Vibrio parahaemolyticus Diarrhea, Chile, 1998 and 2004.
Emerging Infectious Disease journal 11, 129.

Newton, A., Kendall, M., Vugia, D.J., Henao, O.L., Mahon, B.E., 2012. Increasing rates of
vibriosis in the United States, 1996-2010: review of surveillance data from 2
systems. Clinical infectious diseases : an official publication of the Infectious
Diseases Society of America 54 Suppl 5, S391-395.

- Oliver, J.D., 2005. Wound infections caused by Vibrio vulnificus and other marinebacteria. Epidemiology and Infection 133, 383-391.
- Oliver, J.D., 2013. Vibrio vulnificus: Death on the Half Shell. A Personal Journey with
 the Pathogen and its Ecology. Microbial ecology 65, 793-799.
- Piotrowski, A.P., Napiorkowski, M.J., Napiorkowski, J.J., Osuch, M., 2015. Comparing
 various artificial neural network types for water temperature prediction in rivers.
 Journal of Hydrology 529, 302-315.
- Saucier, F.J., 2003. Modeling the formation and circulation processes of water
 masses and sea ice in the Gulf of St. Lawrence, Canada. Journal of Geophysical
 Research 108.
- Sauvé, G., 2010. Official control monitoring programmes for live bivalve molluscs–
 legislative and regulatory approaches: Canada. In: Rees G, Pond K, Kay D, Bartram J,

Domingo JS (eds) Safe Management of Shellfish and Harvest Waters, pp.217–232.
World Health Organization (WHO), London.

Semenza, J.C., Trinanes, J., Lohr, W., Sudre, B., Lofdahl, M., Martinez-Urtaza, J.,
Nichols, G.L., Rocklov, J., 2017. Environmental Suitability of Vibrio Infections in a
Warming Climate: An Early Warning System. Environmental health perspectives
125, 107004.

- Sen, P.K., 1968. Estimates of the regression coefficient based on Kendall's tau.Journal of the American statistical association 63, 1379-1389.
- Šeparović, L., Alexandru, A., Laprise, R., Martynov, A., Sushama, L., Winger, K., Tete,
 K., Valin, M., 2013. Present climate and climate change over North America as
 simulated by the fifth-generation Canadian regional climate model. Climate
 Dynamics 41, 3167-3201.
- 746 Statistics Canada, 2019. Table 32-10-0107-01 Aquaculture, production and value.
- Taylor, M., Cheng, J., Sharma, D., Bitzikos, O., Gustafson, R., Fyfe, M., Greve, R., Murti,
 M., Stone, J., Honish, L., 2018. Outbreak of Vibrio parahaemolyticus associated with
 consumption of raw oysters in Canada, 2015. Foodborne pathogens and disease 15,
 554-559.
- Theil, H., 1950. A rank-invariant method of linear and polynominal regression
 analysis (parts 1-3), Ned. Akad. Wetensch. Proc. Ser. A, pp. 1397-1412.
- Trinh, N.X., Trinh, T.Q., Phan, T.P., Thanh, T.N., Thanh, B.N., 2019. Water
 Temperature Prediction Models in Northern Coastal Area, Vietnam.
- United States Food and Drug Administration (FDA), 2005. Quantitative RiskAssessment on the Public Health Impact of Pathogenic Vibrio parahaemolyticus.
- Vezzulli, L., Colwell, R.R., Pruzzo, C., 2013. Ocean warming and spread of pathogenic
 vibrios in the aquatic environment. Microbial ecology 65, 817-825.
- Vezzulli, L., Grande, C., Reid, P.C., Helaouet, P., Edwards, M., Hofle, M.G., Brettar, I.,
 Colwell, R.R., Pruzzo, C., 2016. Climate influence on Vibrio and associated human
 diseases during the past half-century in the coastal North Atlantic. Proceedings of
 the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America 113, E5062-5071.
- Yue, S., Wang, C., 2004. The Mann-Kendall Test Modified by Effective Sample Size to
 Detect Trend in Serially Correlated Hydrological Series. Water Resources
 Management 18, 201-218.
- Zimmerman, A.M., DePaola, A., Bowers, J.C., Krantz, J.A., Nordstrom, J.L., Johnson,
 C.N., Grimes, D.J., 2007. Variability of total and pathogenic Vibrio parahaemolyticus

densities in northern Gulf of Mexico water and oysters. Applied and environmentalmicrobiology 73, 7589-7596.

770

Journal Prevention

The highlights are:

- The statistical modelling (Random forest and Artificial Neural Network) of the coastal water temperature from air temperature and wind speed.
- Future coastal water temperature scenarios were produced under optimistic and pessimistic climate scenarios, using Artificial Neural Network model.
- Maps of the future Vibrio growth risk indicator were produced, from the future water temperature scenarios.
- Maps show that the Vibrio risk will increase spatially and seasonally regardless the climate change scenario.

Jonulual

Declaration of interests

 \boxtimes The authors declare that they have no known competing financial interests or personal relationships that could have appeared to influence the work reported in this paper.

The authors declare the following financial interests/personal relationships which may be considered as potential competing interests: